

## MINUTES

### CITY PLAN COMMISSION/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

May 7, 2007

A meeting of the City Plan Commission/Architectural Review Board of the City of Clayton, Missouri, met upon the above date at 5:30 p.m., Chairman Harold Sanger presiding. Upon roll call, the following responded:

#### Present

Harold Sanger, Chairman  
Michael A. Schoedel, City Manager  
Steve Lichtenfeld, Aldermanic Representative  
James Liberman  
Marc Lopata

#### Absent:

Mark Zorensky  
Debbie Igielnik

#### Also Present:

Catherine Powers, Director of Planning & Development Services  
Jason Jaggi, Planner  
Kevin O'Keefe, City Attorney

Chairman Sanger welcomed everyone to the meeting and asked that conversations not take place during the meeting and that all cell phone and pager ringers be turned off.

#### MINUTES – NONE

#### SITE PLAN REVIEW/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW – NEW CONSTRUCTION – SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE – 7600 MARYLAND AVE.

Lauren Strutman and Steve Endsley, project architects, Robert and Lori Hermanson, owners and Mike Vonderheide, project's civil engineer were in attendance at the meeting.

Catherine Powers explained that the proposed project consists of the construction of a 2-story brick, 4,867 square foot, approximately 29.8 feet in height, single-family residence with a three-car below grade rear entry garage. The site measures approximately 9,116 square feet and is located in the Hanley Place subdivision. Access to the residence is provided via an existing driveway approach along the east side of the property. She stated that the Zoning Ordinance requires impervious coverage not to exceed 55% for single family residences. The plans indicate

that the existing impervious coverage is 2,858 square feet or approximately 31% of the site. The new plans show impervious coverage at 4,867 square feet or 53.39% of the site, representing an increase of 70%. A storm sewer is not located near this property. The applicant is proposing to construct a rain garden in the rear yard to mitigate storm water. As proposed, two laterals will collect water from the roof and direct them to the rain garden via pop-up emitters. The pop up emitters are designed to slow the flow of water out of the laterals which will then sheet flow to the rain garden. The plans show the elevations of the driveway turnaround to allow water to sheet flow to the yard and eventually to the rain garden. Catherine indicated that the storm water mitigation system plans (including the rain garden) have been prepared by a civil engineer and reviewed by the City's Public Works Department. Trash will be stored within an enclosure off the rear of the driveway turnaround underneath the deck stairs. The HVAC units are located with a recessed area of the house on the west side approximately 5 feet from the property line and screened with a fence. Catherine indicated that there are 53-caliper inches of trees which will be removed from the site with 77.5-caliper inches remaining. The applicant is requesting that three trees totaling 47-inches not be replaced given their poor condition. To support this request, the applicant submitted a report from a certified arborist and the City's contracted landscape architect has concurred that the trees are in poor condition and can be removed without replacement. The applicant has submitted a comprehensive landscape plan which provides replacement of 6 caliper-inches and substantial plantings. In addition, the City's contracted landscape architect has reviewed the landscape plan and indicates that there are two trees totaling 14 caliper inches in the rear which will be impacted by construction and need to be protected. The applicant has indicated on the plans that the City's Tree Protection standards are to be followed. Catherine stated that staff's recommendation is to approve with the following conditions:

1. That the City's contracted Landscape Architect perform two inspections, at the expense of the applicant, to ensure the proper construction of the rain garden system;
2. That proof of the recorded site plan filed with the St. Louis County Recorder of Deeds office be provided to the City prior to the issuance of a building permit.

Ms. Strutman introduced herself, architect Steve Endsley, the owners and the civil engineer to the members. She stated that the structure features a rear entry, tucked-under garage. She noted that there are no retaining walls proposed for the property. She indicated that storm water from the driveway will go to the rain garden.

Chairman Sanger asked about impervious coverage.

Ms. Strutman indicated that impervious coverage is 53.39%; below the allowable 55%. Ms. Strutman then presented a landscape plan, depicting the rain garden, to the members. She indicated that 53 caliper inches of trees will be removed from the site due to construction, with 77.5 caliper inches to remain on the site. She stated that 6 caliper inches of new trees will be planted.

Jim Liberman stated that he is confused about where the storm sewer stops along Maryland.

Catherine Powers stated the storm sewer ends significantly to the west.

Jim Liberman stated that his property is connected at 7620 Maryland.

Ms. Strutman commented that there is a sanitary sewer that runs along the back of the adjacent property, but not a storm sewer.

Catherine Powers advised the members that the Public Works Department and the City's Building Official reviewed the project and indicated no possible connection to a storm sewer.

Chairman Sanger asked how this Board can be assured that the rain garden will mitigate storm water.

Catherine Powers stated that the civil engineer has put his seal on the plans and that the City's contracted landscape architect will also make inspections of the rain garden.

Mr. Vonderheide commented that rain gardens are somewhat new for this area, but they have been successfully used in other communities. He stated that MSD has certain criteria for rain gardens that must be followed.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked how other rain gardens in Clayton have worked.

Catherine Powers indicated that that is difficult to say since most of the rain gardens that have been approved are still under construction.

Ms. Strutman advised the members that the contractor for the Krupke's on Forsyth has stated that their rain garden works quite well.

Marc Lopata asked for an explanation of how the rain garden works.

Mr. Vonderheide stated that most of the surface water will flow to the rear and that the peak run-off will not discharge off the site.

Marc Lopata asked how the City is assured the approved design will remain over time.

Mr. Vonderheide indicated that since the site plan has to be recorded with St. Louis County and because of MSD's regulations, the design cannot be altered nor can the rain garden be removed.

Marc Lopata asked if the rain garden will be dredged.

Mr. Vonderheide replied "yes, periodically."

Chairman Sanger asked if the design either meets or exceeds MSD criteria.

Mr. Vonderheide replied "yes".

Marc Lopata asked if the rain garden is completely full of water, how long it will take to dry out.

Mr. Vonderheide indicated 7 to 8 hours.

Marc Lopata asked how fertilizer is kept out of the rain garden.

Mr. Vonderheide stated he does not know that it can be kept out.

Marc Lopata asked how deep the rain garden is.

Mr. Vonderheide replied about 2 ½ feet deep. He indicated that the site is relatively flat, so water from the emitters will move slowly.

Marc Lopata asked about the large trees that were cut down off the site.

Mr. Hermanson indicated that he personally did not remove any trees from the site. He stated that Ameren UE was cutting down trees in the area.

Marc Lopata stated he has a problem with not replacing those trees.

Catherine Powers commented that it has been determined that many of the trees were more than 50% dead and could be hazardous and therefore, do not require replacement.

Marc Lopata voiced his concern about losing 70% greenspace.

Catherine Powers commented that many trees that exist will remain.

Steve Lichtenfeld referred to the drainage plan. He stated the contours show water flowing from east to west.

Mr. Vonderheide stated that there will be some run-off onto adjacent property, but that the majority of the water will go to the rear of the site. He stated some of the run-off cannot be controlled.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if there will be a swale.

Mr. Vonderheide stated that there is one on the west side that goes towards this property.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked about the west side.

Mr. Vonderheide indicated that there is only a 5-foot wide grass strip.

Jim Liberman asked if the 600 line can be pulled to the north.

Mr. Vonderheide stated that would change the grade of the garage.

Chairman Sanger asked if either of the adjacent neighbors were in attendance

Mr. Bruce, owner of 7606 Maryland, was in attendance.

Chairman Sanger asked if he experiences any water run-off now.

Mr. Bruce indicated none that he has noticed.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if a compromise could take place by leaving the 600 elevation to the south of the stairs but curve to form a swale. He stated that in the past, more impervious coverage equals more water run-off to neighboring property.

Mr. Vonderheide stated they could do that; he added that they are trying to keep the driveway relatively flat.

Steve Lichtenfeld indicated that staff could take a look at that.

Catherine Powers agreed. She stated that they could work with the Public Works Department and the applicant to come up with a solution to minimize water run-off onto the neighboring property.

Marc Lopata again asked the depth of the rain garden below final grade.

Mr. Vonderheide replied 2 ½ feet.

Mr. Bruce asked how far back on the lot the house will sit. He stated his concern about losing light.

Ms. Strutman stated the new house to the east is 50 feet deep; this house is 64 feet deep.

Mr. Bruce commented that adding 15-feet is significant.

Marc Lopata asked the depth of the existing house.

Ms. Strutman replied “about 30 feet”.

Jason Jaggi indicated 28 feet deep.

Chairman Sanger asked about coverage.

Catherine Powers stated that the house is well within the setbacks and impervious coverage is below the maximum allowed.

Mr. Bruce advised the members that the previous owners removed 4 to 5 trees from the site.

Marc Lopata made a motion to table this item so the storm water mitigation plan can be re-engineered.

Motion failed due to lack of a second.

Steve Lichtenfeld made a motion to approve the site plan subject to staff recommendations, that the rain garden meet MSD design standards (criteria) and that staff review the contours for minimal drainage to adjacent properties. The motion was seconded by Mike Schoedel and received the following vote: Ayes: Chairman Sanger, Steve Lichtenfeld, Mike Schoedel, and Jim Liberman. Nays: Marc Lopata.

The architectural aspects of the project were now up for review.

Catherine Powers announced that a corrected memorandum has been placed at each member's seat. The corrected memo depicts the removal of the mention of a retaining wall that is not part of this proposal. Catherine explained that the proposed residence will be constructed of mixed-red brick. Stone will be used as an accent around the windows, doorways and the foundation walls. Windows will be a mix of casement and double-hung, black in color. A below-grade rear-entry three-car garage is proposed. According to the application, the garage door is to be raised steel panel; the color is not specified. The driveway is to be constructed of exposed aggregate concrete. The roofing material will be asphalt, gray in color. Trash will be located in an enclosure off the driveway turnaround screened with wood fence and metal gate. The HVAC units are located within a recessed area on the side of the house and screened with a fence. A large partially covered wood deck is proposed off the rear of the house. The plans show this deck to have ornamentation such as post lights and brackets. Given the depth of the property the deck is within the rear yard setback area. Staff's recommendation is to approve as submitted.

Ms. Strutman stated that the residence is an all brick, mixed-red in color, traditional style home. She stated that the home will feature a stone veneer foundation around all elevations and that cast stone is used as an accent around the windows to match the foundation. Samples of the brick, stone and window were presented.

Chairman Sanger asked if the owners will have to drive under the rear deck to access the garage.

Ms. Strutman replied "yes".

Marc Lopata asked about the clearance around the HVAC units, as shown on Sheet A.5. He stated the surrounding enclosure needs to be larger to provide more clearance. He suggested that the ceiling above the HVAC units be sloped.

Being no further questions or comments, Steve Lichtenfeld made a motion to approve as submitted with the condition that the ceiling above the HVAC units be sloped. The motion was seconded by Mike Schoedel and received unanimous approval.

Chairman Sanger asked staff to provide a report on how the rain gardens are performing.

Catherine Powers stated that staff would be happy to review and provide a report in one year.

Chairman Sanger agreed.

Mr. Mel Disney, Clayton resident, suggested recording the MSD agreement.

Catherine Powers stated the agreement (standards) is still being prepared.

Mr. Vonderheide indicated that he believes the standards will be recorded.

#### OUTDOOR DINING – 16 S. BEMISTON – CANDICCI'S

No one was in attendance to make the presentation.

Mike Schoedel made a motion to table this item; seconded by Marc Lopata and unanimously approved by the Board.

#### SIGN SUB-DISTRICT – THE CRESCENT – 153 CARONDELET PLAZA

Mr. Mark Mehlman, developer and Mr. Todd Mayberry, sign contractor, were in attendance at the meeting.

Mr. Mayberry explained that the signage will continue the scale of retail along Forsyth and is designed to convey the quality and character of Forsyth.

A Power Point presentation began. Slides depicting signage detailing and scaling were presented. Mr. Mayberry stated that lighting will be tucked under the awnings to create a subtle glow. He stated the blade signs will be perpendicular to the store fronts. A slide depicting the entrance to the residential portion of the building was shown (Crescent name and logo sandblasted into the wall face). Renderings and detailing of identification signs for entry into the parking garage were also presented.

Jim Liberman asked if the awnings will be different colors.

Mr. Mayberry replied “yes”. He stated that did not want the awnings to be monolithic and believes the varying colors will allow the tenants flexibility.

Jim Liberman asked if there are specific colors to choose from.

Mr. Mayberry replied “yes”; he stated no two awnings will be the same color, so once a tenant chooses an awning color, that color would no longer be available to other tenants.

Chairman Sanger asked Mark Mehlman if he could provide some tenant information.

Mr. Mehlman indicated that the following tenants will be leasing space at The Crescent: Kaldi's Coffee House (approx. 2,000 square feet), Pulaski Bank (approx. 4,000 square feet), Araka Restaurant (approx. 7,000 square feet) and Extra Virgin, an olive oil retailer (approx. 1,200 square feet). He stated that two women's boutiques and a children's boutique have submitted a letter of intent to occupy. Additionally, three other restaurants have shown interest in becoming tenants.

Chairman Sanger asked if there are nine tenant spaces.

Mr. Mehlman replied "yes".

Chairman Sanger asked that the awnings be coordinated in some manner.

Jason Jaggi advised the members that there is a color pallet from which to choose awning color.

Steve Lichtenfeld commented that the building will be a very strong visual presence and likes the idea of multiple awning colors. He asked what the awning color result would be if one tenant occupies two spaces. He asked if that would result in two separate awning colors.

Mr. Mayberry replied "no"; he stated both awnings would be the same color if for one tenant.

Steve Lichtenfeld commented that the blade signs appear to match the awning in the rendering.

Mr. Mayberry stated the blade sign will match the awning color as chosen by the tenant.

Catherine Powers reminded the members that this is a "sign district" and as such, is different than a typical signage approval.

Jim Liberman stated that it seems like a lot of signage for one tenant space.

Mike Schoedel indicated that it is not inconsistent with what is currently permitted.

Jim Liberman asked if the tenants would have to come back before this Board for final signage approval.

Jason Jaggi replied "no", but each tenant would have to apply for and receive a Sign Permit.

Kevin O'Keefe suggested recording the sign indentures for the sub-district with the County and that any changes to the indentures to be approved by the City prior to such change being implemented.

Mr. Mayberry noted a correction to the submittal in that the blade signs are not to be lit by any means and that the address signs are 4" in height.

Kevin O’Keefe asked that the submittal be revised for accuracy and that the revised documentation be forwarded to the City’s Planning Department for retention in the file.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if this sub-district only includes the property that The Crescent occupies at this time.

Catherine Powers replied “yes”. She stated that in the event of a change, either a second sub-district would have to be approved by this Board or the approved sub-district would have to be amended and approved by this Board.

Being no further questions or comments, Mike Schoedel made a motion to approve the sub-district subject to the re-drafting of the signage descriptions for accuracy for submittal to City staff for their review and approval and that the sub-district indentures be filed/recorded with St. Louis County. The motion was seconded by Steve Lichtenfeld and unanimously approved by the Board.

Being no further business for the Plan Commission/Architectural Review Board, this meeting adjourned at 7:05 p.m.

---

Recording Secretary